

Teachers Creativity Center

Evaluation Report Human Right and Civic Education Program

2015

Content outline:

Introduction

The Teacher Creativity Center (TCC):

Objectives of the two programs under evaluation

Scope of this evaluation

Evaluation methodology

1. Relevance
 - 1.1. Relevance at National Level
 - 1.2. Relevance at Institutional Level
 - 1.3. Relevance at the Target Group Level
Participation
 2. Efficiency
 - 2.1. Civic Education Program
 - 2.1.1. Capacity building for educational cadre on civic education concepts
 - 2.1.2. Capacity building for students on civic education
 - 2.1.3. Involvement of stakeholders and decision maker in citizenship education
 - 2.2. Efficiency of Human Right Program
 - 2.2.1. Advocacy toward increased public spending on education & Global campaigns for EFA
 - 2.2.2. Submission of draft policy recommendation supporting PDRL
 - 2.2.3. Capacity building for the GUPWD members in right of PWD
 - 2.2.4. Advocate toward implementing new policies supporting PDRL
 - 2.2.5. Capacity building for educational cadre on human right values
 - 2.2.6. School dropout initiatives
 - 2.2.7. Restoration of the normal socio-academic performance for children
 3. Effectiveness
 - 3.1. Effectiveness of Civic education program
 - 3.1.1. The ability of the educational cadre to implement a more established system of citizenship and human right value
 - 3.1.2. Ability of children and youth to practice citizenship values
 - 3.1.3. Establishment and activation of dialogue among stakeholders regarding goals, approaches, methods, and obstacles of citizenship and human right education
 - 3.2. Effectiveness of Human right program
 - 3.2.1. Ability of advocacy campaigns to change government policies related to spending on education and EFA goals
 - 3.2.2. Implementation of draft policy recommendation supporting PDRL
 - 3.2.3. Ability of GUPWD members to advocate for right of PWD
 - 3.2.4. Ability of educational cadre to transfer and integrate the concepts of human right
 - 3.2.5. Decrease students dropout
 - 3.2.6. Improvement of the socio – academic level of children
- Monitoring and Evaluation
4. Impact
 5. Sustainability
 6. Challenges faced during implementation of the programs
 7. Lessons learned and recommendations
 8. Annexes

➤ Executive summery

Teacher Creativity Center (TCC) is a Palestinian, non-profit, non-governmental organization that was established in 1995 by a group of primary and secondary teachers working in public, private, and UNRWA schools aiming to integrate civic education including concepts of democracy, human rights, gender and tolerance in the Palestinian schools.

This evaluation aims to assess the two main programs of TCC, the Civic Education Program and the Human Rights program to measure the programs' achievements and their impact on the various stakeholders, and to provide insights into how many of the programs target groups have been reactive and responsive to the goals and objectives over the past year 2014. The evaluation will measure five pillars which are relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, impact and sustainability, as well as considering the lessons learned and recommendation derived out of this evaluation. The evaluation team used a participatory approach and feedback from all stakeholders, review of all literature related to the programs, field visits, meetings with stakeholders and focus group discussions.

Relevance: The two programs were in line with the National and strategic needs and priorities that tackle the scope of the right for education, and human rights, where investment in education is considered one of the pillars for the economic, social and political development This will contribute to the democratic Palestinian society that supports human rights, equality, and social justice. At the national level there are many indicators that reflect the necessity for investment in the educational process to build a new generation able to make changes. For more than 40 years, communities in the West Bank including East Jerusalem and Gaza have been subject to varying conditions of the recurrent conflict and occupation which has negatively impacted education, including violation of right to education; damage and destruction of property and schools; arrest and detention of children and youth, restrictions on movement, and restrictions from the Israeli Civil Administration (ICA) on developing educational infrastructure. At the same time spending on education is considered low (3%) compared to the need. In observation of the human rights situation in the occupied Palestinian territory (oPt), further deterioration is reported in 2014, as Israeli forces perpetrated more violations of the international law. At the same time both strategic plans for TCC and Novib share the same principle of quality education, developing the capacities for the educational staff in human rights and civic education to be able to empower and mobilize their students toward citizenship and human rights values, and both programs were in line with the strategic plan of the MoE (the main partner). TCC contributed in development and creative thinking at the educational sector through implementing the citizenship projects, at the same time TCC covered part of the MoE activities in the targeted communities. The literature review showed that educational environments engaging young people as active participants in their own learning are linked with higher student attendance and student achievement, greater creativity and conceptual learning, and increased intrinsic motivation and determination in learning. It is clearly noticed that

TCC is working in a participatory approach with the partners in both programs, including but not limited to MoH, NGOs, local councils, municipalities, and the donors.

Efficiency: In 2014 the **civic education program** became constructed, conceptualized with clear objectives. There was a clear plan to target the direct beneficiaries to strengthen, empower and arm them with the most effective methods to be able to work towards a democratic society. More than 300 educational stakeholders including teachers, supervisors, and school principals, in the MoH and UNRWA schools received the concept of civic education training, in addition to conducting awareness sessions to parents, local communities, and members from CBOs, CSOs, and media. Over 15500 Palestinian students received the knowledge and skills from the educational cadre in the targeted 30 schools in the West Bank. The educational cadre gained the knowledge and skills of how to conduct research, data collection, analysis, decision making, and team work in which they will transfer what they gained to their students. The students gained the knowledge and the skills that help in building their personality and raise their awareness about citizenship and human rights such as communication skills, skills of selecting priority projects, how to learn about policies and laws, how to study projects' documentation, how to conduct audits and do accountability sessions and public hearings sessions. The civil society and the local community realized the importance of civic education and participated in the evaluation of the students' projects. Community and stakeholders participation gave the students power, self-confidence, and the ability to change. With these positive outcomes, this can implant the spirit of citizenship. At the same time, the clear mission was formalized for the **human rights program** in 2014 and it was the first time being implemented as an independent program with clear goals. TCC with collaboration with PEC played an active role at the national level to advocate for EFA. They demanded from the Palestinian government to provide rehabilitation for schools and educational institutions to become more inclusive and accessible for persons with disability, allocate sufficient budgets for education to allow development in education for persons with disability, prepare plans for teacher qualification for teaching persons with disability, approve inclusive policies for educational institutions, sensitization of curricula to disability issues,, improve provision of information and indicators on disability issues , and ensure implementation of legislations pertaining to needs of persons with disability in the educational environment. More work is recommended to be done at this level, with increased involvement from the NGOs, CBOs, in addition to GO institutions. Regarding the work to support PWD, TCC provided GUPWD members with knowledge and skills of project cycle management and fundraising and sign language. The participants included the young members with various types of disability. Under the advocacy campaign that aimed at supporting rights of persons with disability, many activities have been conducted by TCC with cooperation of PEC, and the involvement of different organizations. Throughout the human rights program the educational cadre received awareness sessions on human rights education, including child rights, law of child labor, the institutions that support child rights, in addition to the skills of communication, speech, presentation and discussion, where teachers would be able to transfer the knowledge and skills to their students. The students gained the knowledge and skills of children's rights, the structure of the Legislative Council, its function and mission, they also obtained knowledge of operating national and international conventions and declarations protecting various rights especially those related to children, they received

skills on how to implement campaigns that targeted child rights issues, such as school dropout and child labor.

Effectiveness: As a result of the analysis of the project documents, and the data driven from the focus groups and the interviews for **the civic education program**, we conclude that the objectives of the program were greatly achieved. The Program was able to establish a system of citizenship and human rights value within the educational system, in which the educational cadre became able to integrate the action learning methodology into their teaching style. The program promoted the value of citizenship among children regarding a just and democracy. They gained knowledge for positive attitudes and were able to apply the knowledge and skills they gained on actual cases, the students gained the ability to practice team work, and the ability to communicate with the external environment. They gained the ability to discuss, negotiate and persuade. While the stakeholders and civil society were mobilized enough in the area of citizenship and human rights education, the civic education program succeeded in conducting effective fruitful community dialogue presenting the results of the projects. Some communities contributed in solving the problems based on the alternatives the students suggested. Implementing citizenship projects with coordination and participation from local communities allowed for the strengthening of the relationship between the schools and the decision makers at the local level, and therefore supporting the schools. At **the human rights program** level, TCC with the cooperation of PEC, and other partners worked toward mobilizing the civil society to work for changing government policies toward achieving EFA goals, and promotion of educational and social inclusion of women, men, boys, and girls without gender and or disability as a result of the advocacy campaigns at the national, global, and institutional level. There is no clear effect on the policies regarding EFA due to many challenges that are out of control. PEC succeeded to expand the circle of Palestinian organization that joined the advocacy campaign during GAW. It was noticed that GAW 2014 was rich with variety of activities that targeted all locations and addressed persons with disability, children, parents, teachers, community activities and decision makers, in addition to advocacy toward implementation of draft of recommendation for supporting PDRL. More work is still required from TCC and all stakeholders. As a result of empowering the members in GUPWD, they were able to advocate for their rights. Clear effects were noticed on the performance of the teachers who received human rights training .As a result of student's initiatives no. of drop out cases was decreased in the targeted schools.

Impact: Both Programs, (the citizenship and the human rights) will contribute in increasing and improving the children and youth's access to quality education that will ensure the achievement of EFA goals, and therefore improve the educational status that will be reflected on building a democratic society. Results of both programs in developing educational staff capacities in civic education value will contribute in improving educational child rights and the building of a solid educational system based on scientific methodology. We believe that both programs will contribute in improving social and educational indicators related to the status of Palestinian children. The human rights program, with all the activities that targeted PWD, labor children, girls and boys without gender discrimination, will contribute in meeting the gender sensitive needs in the educational system, and therefore will contribute in decreasing the side effects of gender and disability discrimination. The effects of advocacy campaigns with the involvement of different stakeholders will contribute in enhancing the commitment

to the Palestinian Disability Right Law. The effects of the two programs on the staff of the center will contribute in defending human rights and citizenship issues during the workshops and the conferences. This will contribute in the ability of the center to expand its goals and to advocate toward policy changes toward a democratic society.

Sustainability: TCC was able to build a network of partners on a strategic level nationally, internationally, and locally. This gives them the power to maintain continuity of both projects, while financial support will assure the sustainability, legitimacy, and increase the quality of the activities among all the targeted goals. Regarding the capacity building for the educational cadre, the expert and the academic institutions including MoE, and UNRWA provided the participants with the knowledge and skills that they will need to continue to transfer to other groups or classes. We believe that they can now be considered as a human resource at the national and institutional level. The archived materials that were produced through both programs will be considered one of the sustainable materials that will be used in the future. At the same time the citizenship curriculum became well developed and structured which is also considered as sustainable material for the future generations. The accumulation of knowledge skills, values, and attitudes among the staff working with the TCC is considered one of the major factors that can play a role in the continuation of similar programs. The students who were trained will carry the knowledge and the skills with them to higher education institutes. Some of the local communities who participated in the design and implementation of the projects promised to continue working on them even after the project. Working with MoE and UNRWA, the Teacher Creativity Center will have the chance to keep working on the citizenship project in the schools to ensure sustainability. The strong relationship with MoE will allow TCC to involve and effectively participate in the strategic plan of the MoE and therefore have the ability to enrich the plan with the concepts and the value of citizenship and human rights programs. GUPWD gained the knowledge and the skills that empowered them to be one of the active unions that advocate for the right of PWD.

Recommendations:

- ❖ Continue the financial and technical support for TCC
- ❖ Continue and expand both programs at the national level targeting the governmental, UNRWA, and private schools.
- ❖ Continue with the capacity building for the teachers based on their training needs.
- ❖ Strengthening the relationship with the local communities and the CBOs.
- ❖ Intensify the work on the strategic goals with the partnership of MoE.
- ❖ Continue with the same strategy of advocacy campaign.
- ❖ Use a variety of means of media for advocacy purposes.
- ❖ The TCC staff needs advanced capacity building in advanced human right and civic education concepts and training methodology.
- ❖ Formalization of local bodies/committees at the community level supported by TCC
- ❖ Scientific research and studies needed to be done at the national level and at the target group level for example base line/end line studies.
- ❖ Documentation of the civic education model is recommended.

➤ **Introduction:**

In its broadest definition, “civic education” means all the processes that affect people's beliefs, commitments, capabilities, and actions as members or prospective members of communities. Civic education need not be intentional or deliberate; institutions and communities transmit values and norms without meaning to.

There are several good reasons for the emphasis on schools. First, empirical evidence shows that civic habits and values are relatively easily to influence and change while people are still young, so schooling can be effective when other efforts to educate citizens would fail¹. Another reason is that schools in many countries have an explicit mission to educate students for citizenship.² Civic Education in a democracy is education in self-government. If citizens are to exercise their rights and discharge their responsibilities as members of self-governing communities, they not only need to acquire a body of knowledge; they also need to acquire relevant intellectual and participatory skills. Intellectual skills in civics and government are inseparable from content. To be able to think critically about a political issue, for example, one must have an understanding of the issue, its history, its contemporary relevance, as well as command of a set of intellectual tools or considerations useful in dealing with such an issue. The intellectual skills essential for informed, effective, and responsible citizenship sometimes are called critical thinking skills.³ However the literature review showed that civic education can have meaningful and relatively long-lasting effects in terms of increasing political information, increasing feelings of empowerment, and mobilizing individuals, even in contexts of political and ethnic violence. Moreover, the size of the effects depends critically on how the programs are designed, the kinds of pedagogical methods employed, and the quality of the trainers.⁴

Moreover knowledge of human rights and freedoms is considered a fundamental tool to guarantee respect for the right of all, on the other hand, human rights education is an integral part of the right to education. Education should integrate values such as peace, non -discrimination, equality, justice, non-violence, tolerance, and human dignity. Quality education is based on a human rights approach, and the means that rights are implemented throughout the whole education process and in all learning environments. In recent years, a large number of organizations were established in developing countries, and even in the industrialized world to monitor human rights violations and to advance civic education.

¹ Sherrod, Flanagan, and Youniss, 2002

² Civic Education, First published Thu Dec 27, 2007; substantive revision Thu May 30, 2013

³ Margaret Stimmann Branson, Associate Director, Center for Civic Education , The Role of Civic Education , A Forthcoming Education Policy Task Force Position Paper from the Communitarian Network , September 1998

⁴ STEVEN E. FINKEL , THE IMPACT OF ADULT CIVIC EDUCATION PROGRAMMES IN DEVELOPING DEMOCRACIES * University of Pittsburgh, USA , public administration and development Public Admin. Dev. 34, 169–181 (2014) Published online in Wiley Online Library (wileyonlinelibrary.com) DOI: 10.1002/pad.1678

➤ **The Teacher Creativity Center (TCC):**

In 1997, one year after the election of the first Palestinian government, the Palestinian curriculum was established with a vision to make teaching methods more participative. Within this new educational framework, the Civic Education Curriculum was created. From the beginning, three members of TCC were involved in defining the new curriculum. Along with other educational experts they were requested to work with the Center for Curriculum Development, which is part of the Ministry of Education. In 2000, TCC participated in evaluation of the civic education curriculum, specifically the 6th grade, upon the request of the Ministry of Education. This was the start of the initiation of a long-term project on “Integrating Human Rights, Democracy, and Gender Concepts into Education”, with the participation of teachers from all over the West Bank and Gaza Strip, which culminated with the publication of a guide for teachers concerning the integration of human rights issues into education. In 2012, TCC was considered formally a member organization in the UNESCO.

Mission: Contributing to a democratic Palestinian society that upholds human rights, equality and social justice.

Vision: Developing democratic, safety and reinforcing educational environment in Palestine to enhance respect to human rights and civic education values.

Institutional objectives:

- To promote Palestinian children’s right and access to quality, inclusive, compulsory and free education, as enshrined in the international law and according to the EFA goals.
- To contribute to a youth generation that believes in and able to promote and protect the universal values and standards of HRs and international law in Palestine
- To contribute to an informed, tolerant, active and responsible Palestinian citizenry that is involved in governance and all public life affairs.
- To contribute to the restoration of the normal socio-academic performance of Palestinian children suffering from socio-academic dysfunction associated with cognitive and socio-emotional learning challenges including war-related traumas.

Thus, the structure of TCC programs included (2011-2013) the Educational Observer program which serves the first strategic goal, Human Rights program and Civic

Education programs which serve the second strategic goal, and the Social Responsibility Program which serves the third strategic goal.

Purpose of the evaluation:

The two main programs of TCC, the Civic Education Program and the Human Rights program will be evaluated, to assess the programs' achievements and their impact on the various stakeholders, and to provide insights into how many of the programs target groups have been reactive and responsive to the goals and objectives over the past year 2014.

➤ **Objectives of the two programs under evaluation:**

Civic Education Program outcomes/outputs:

1. Dialogue among stakeholders regarding citizenship and human rights education, its goals, approaches and methods, in addition to obstacles, misconceptions and areas of improvement is established and activated;
 - 1.1. 300 Educational stakeholders (teachers, educational supervisors, experts, academic institutions, MoE, UNRWA Education Office, parents, parents' councils, local communities, CBOs, CSOs, private sector, media) and community institutions involved in schools initiatives showcased and honored through an educational conference;
 - 1.2. At least three T.V episodes discussing citizenship education with educational and social experts, MoE officials, community members, youth, and civil society representatives;
 - 1.3. Published study that examines the extent to which citizenship values promoted by the Civic Education Program are aligned with those underlined in the civic education curriculum.
2. Citizenship values among children and youth is promoted;
 - 2.1. More than 15500 Palestinian students are more active in promoting a just and democratic society. They have knowledge, skills, positive attitudes and experience to apply innovative, creative and non-violent approaches for resolving conflict, addressing community issues specifically in disability field as active responsible citizens producing positive change;
3. A more established system of citizenship and human rights values within the educational system is implemented;
 - 3.1. Educational cadre in 30 vulnerable locations have enhanced knowledge and skills of civic education concepts, promoting concepts of citizenship, and utilize this knowledge and skills in their work positions as teachers, principals,

supervisors;

- 3.2. Principals in 30 vulnerable locations have the ability to promote the positive change in their schools environment and implement quality initiatives addressing school problems.

Human Rights Program Outcomes/outputs:

1. Civil society's active participation in changing government policies related to spending on education and towards achieving EFA goals is promoted;
 - 1.1 Playing an active role in the National NGO Team on Monitoring Government Budget to advocate for increased public spending on education, through the Palestinian Education Coalition;
 - 1.2 Active participation in the National Committee on Women Rights, through the Palestinian Education Coalition;
 - 1.3 Playing an active role in the Global Campaign for Education for All, through the Palestinian Education Coalition;
 - 1.4 Submission of draft policy recommendations supporting PDRL issued with contribution of 360 GUPWD members, given to The Higher Council of Persons with Disability;
2. Educational and social inclusion of women, men, boys and girls without gender and/ or disability based discrimination among communities, teachers, children and the youth is promoted;
 - 2.1 1500 GUPWD members, supporters, PWD families and caretakers and youth have increased awareness in rights of PWD;
 - 2.2 At least 300 GUPWD youth leaders, students, activists, disability activists and advocates pressure MoE/ MoSA /PA decision makers and the community to implement new policies supporting PDRL.
 - 2.3 600 teachers in 30 vulnerable targeted communities have increased awareness and enhanced attitudes towards human rights education, and least 90 teachers in the targeted communities integrate human rights values in their teaching practice
 - 2.4 Teachers, students and communities in 30 vulnerable locations contribute to reducing number of school dropouts and re-integrating of children who were engaged in child labor;
300 young women and men in 30 vulnerable locations carry out initiatives to promote learning environments that are more sensitive to girls, boys, women and men's practical needs;

➤ **Scope of this evaluation: the evaluation will measure five areas :**

1. How are the activities of both programs perceived by targeted people and relevant institutions and authorities? (Relevance)
2. Is the balance between the input of resources (human and material) and the output appropriate? (Efficiency)
3. How much are the program's objective and goal reached? (Effectiveness)
4. What impact have the programs had on targeted and non-targeted communities and relevant institutions and authorities? (Impact)
5. Do the targeted communities / groups / stakeholders and institutions understand impacts and importance of the activities and become able and motivated enough to continue these activities by themselves after the end of these programs? (Sustainability)

➤ **Evaluation methodology**

The evaluation team used a participatory approach and feedback from all stakeholders, especially the beneficiaries; Literature/Documentation review includes review of all literature related to the programs and the socio-economic conditions in the targeted areas; reviewing proposal, reports, and documentations. Field visits, meetings with stakeholders and focus group discussions to gain an understanding of the programs' context and the nature of the problems being addressed.

Qualitative assessment:

Focus group discussion (4 groups) / see annexes for locations and sex :

- Focus group with teachers supervisors & principals , one for each program (2)
- Focus group with students. one for each program (2)

Interview with (12 persons):

- TCC , general director and program managers , (4)
- 1 school principal , and 4 supervisors. Two for each program (5)
- Representative from MoE, PEC, GUPWD. (3)

1. Relevance:

The two programs were in line with the National and strategic needs and priorities that tackle the scope of the right for education, and human rights, where investment in education is considered one of the pillars for economic, social and political development. This will contribute to the democratic Palestinian society in supporting human rights, equality and social justice.

1.1. Relevance at National Level:

Civic education and human right programs:

Investment in education is considered one of the pillars for economic, social and political development. Both programs are relevant to national needs and priorities. The desk review of TCC documents and the literature review showed that there are many indicators that reflect the necessity for investment in the educational process to build a new generation in a democratic society. In the occupied Palestinian territory (oPt) many school children still have restricted access to quality, protected education due to occupation polices including military checkpoints and settler harassment, where they become in need of urgent humanitarian assistance. For more than 40 years, communities in the West Bank including East Jerusalem and Gaza have been subject to varying conditions of the recurrent conflict and occupation which has negatively impacted education. These conditions include armed conflict, military incursions, and violence; violations of rights including the right to education; damage and destruction of property and schools; arrest and detention of children and youth; disruption of schooling; restrictions on movement including access to education and schooling; impediments and restrictions from the Israeli Civil Administration (ICA) on developing educational infrastructure according to minimum humanitarian standards; displacement; and the array of psycho-social effects including excessive stress, trauma and fear.

These problems result in drop-out, lack of attendance, decreased learning time in school, and deterioration of the quality of learning, as well as in separation of families in their efforts to ensure that their children and youth continue their education. Girls are more likely to stop attending when faced with harassment, violence and intimidation at checkpoints or on their commute to school. Some of the violence, harassment and intimidation are also gender-based. Implementing the citizenship and human right activities in the affected communities and school considered one of the strategies that promote the resilience of the people. In addition the allocated budget for education is considered low compared to the neighbors. For example, Israel allocated the highest budget in the world for education and research (8.3%), while in oPt the amount reached (3%) and most of the spending goes to current expenditure rather than development.⁵ The Palestinian Authority lacks the ability to achieve Education for All (EFA) goals within the current situation regarding expansion of early childhood care and education. Promotion of learning and life skills for young people and adults, and improvements in

⁵ Journal of Middle East 2007

the quality of education, due to the inadequate resources and capacity lacks focus and accountability as well as sustainable development , while the need to continue on the advocacy campaigns is one of great importance

Education is a universal human right and it is also a means of achieving other human rights and it is an empowering social and economic tool. Through the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, the world's nations agreed that everyone has the right to education. Working toward achievement of EFA will automatically improve the quality of education and contribute in building an effective generation.

Considering the human rights situation in the occupied Palestinian territory (oPt), further deterioration is reported in 2014, as Israeli forces perpetrated more violations of the international law, some of which amount to war crimes. In the West Bank, Israeli forces created an apartheid system under where they controlled Palestinian lands; confiscated water resources; expanded settlements; confiscated property; fully protected Israeli settlers who often attack Palestinian civilians and property. Under these circumstances, the human rights situation deteriorated.⁶

The continuing destruction of the Palestinian education system by Israeli occupation and apartheid is not only an attack on the lives of individuals but threatens the development of the whole of Palestinian society. The obstacles placed in front of Palestinian youth accessing educational facilities and obtaining education and knowledge that can contribute to them and their people living in dignity and freedom are part of Israel's apartheid policies.

1.2. Relevance at Institutional Level :

The strategic goals of TCC and Novib are in line with the two programs goals. TCC strategic goals focused on quality education that ensure the achievement of the goals related to EFA, and developing the capacities for the educational staff in human rights and civic education, so as to achieve effective educational methodology to be able to empower and mobilize their students toward citizenship. Additionally, TCC is part of the Palestinian National Committee on Gender and Women Political Participation, which provides the center with a big role at the advocacy level, and adds to the value of making issues of inequalities of education a priority.

Meanwhile the center is working in a holistic approach targeting all stakeholders in the educational aspect toward safe democratic school environment in accordance with human rights and civic value. In order to achieve the strategic goals three programs

⁶Report on the Human Rights Situation in the oPt ,Palestinian Center for Human Right 2014

were developed including: The Human Rights program, the Civic Education program and the Psychosocial Support Program. The strategic plan also emphasized a holistic approach to advocacy and campaigning on the local and regional level as well as more work with parents' councils/parents in their role of protecting children's rights in schools.

Novib mission is " A just world, without poverty", achieved by multiple goals including the right to sustainable livelihood resources, the right to basic social services, the right to life and security, the right to social and political participation, and the right to an identity. Concerning education Novib believes that education and health care are essential for building better societies. Even as they make progress towards universal primary education, when governments fail to deliver, Oxfam together with partner organizations invest in quality basic social services. They believe that when people can participate in public decisions that affect them, they can build independent livelihoods and thriving communities. Together with partners they give people access to information and a voice. At the same time they believe that gender inequality is both a violation of human rights and an obstacle to sustainable development. In a just world they work toward no place for the discrimination of women and minorities.

The civic education program focused on the establishment and achievement of a dialogue among educational stakeholders regarding goals, approaches and methods of citizenship and human rights education in addition to obstacles and challenges, through their involvement in the project activities. The project worked toward capacity building for the educational cadre, promotion of citizenship value among school students, and establishment of a system of citizenship and human rights values within the educational system. The human right program focused on mobilizing the civil society to participate in changing government policies related to spending on education and towards achieving EFA goals through different advocacy activities that have been designed and implemented by the Palestinian Education Coalition (PEC), including monitoring for government budget, by National NGO Team, participation in the National Committee on Women Rights, playing an active role in the National (EFA) campaign in addition to working toward policies supporting PDRL. The human rights program worked toward giving an equal chance for males and females regardless of gender and disabilities, through capacity building for the educational cadre and advocacy activities support of new policies. Working on civic education and human rights, TCC is trying to fill the gap that is present in the Palestinian curriculum that lacks one of the most important values to be learned at schools. Both programs were in line with the strategic plan of the MoE (the main partner). TCC contributed in the development and creative thinking at the

educational sector through implementing the citizenship projects, at the same time TCC covered part of the MoE activities in the targeted communities.

1.3. Relevance at the Target Group Level

The average no. of children under 18 years is 2.04 million in OPT, 47.6 % from the total population ⁷ , Children under the age of five make up 14.8 percent; 13.0 percent of children are aged between 5-9 years; 12.2 percent are in the 10-14 years age group; and 7.1 percent are in the 15-17 year age group. These age groups need special focus at different sectors mainly for health and education. The average poverty level among Palestinian households based on patterns of consumption was 20.7 percent in 2011: 14.5 percent in West Bank and 32.6 percent in Gaza Strip. Also, 27.2 percent of all children suffer from poverty: 18.5 percent in West Bank and 39.3 percent in Gaza Strip.

At the civic education program: reviewing the literature showed that for a democracy to survive and flourish, its citizens must know about the basic features of a democratic political system to be able to access it when interested, and they must believe in the importance of key democratic values. They must also be willing and able to participate in local and national politics, and they must believe that their participation is important to the continued viability of the democratic political system. The tool to counter the lack of democratic socialization is civic education, the necessary skills and knowledge that helps promote support for democratic behaviors and values among ordinary citizens.

Other studies show that educational environments engaging young people as active participants in their own learning are linked with higher student attendance and student achievement, greater creativity and conceptual learning, and increased intrinsic motivation and determination in learning. Moreover, recent brain and cognitive research points to the value of the democratic education learning environment, including key elements such as collaborative projects, and learning through active experiences.⁸

This reflects the importance of democratic education in making young people not passive recipients of knowledge, but rather as active co-creators of their own learning. They are not the products of an education system, but rather valued participants in a vibrant learning community.

Results from the evaluation for civil education project done in Gaza and West Bank showed that, the majority of the teachers who teach social studies including civil education have never received training on the topic nor on methodologies such as action

⁷PCBS 2012

⁸ Caine, R. N. et al (2008). 12 Brain/Mind learning principles in action: Developing executive functions of the human brain. California: Corwin Press.

learning that increase the involvement of the students before starting their job. They require advanced in-service training⁹.

Another result from “Sharek” report /2013 showed that there is a decrease in youth membership in various community organizations, and the proportion of youth who participate in community-based organizations doesn’t exceed the 27%.with unequal distribution between male and female, favorite for men .¹⁰ According to the Palestinian Central Bureau of Statistics “PCBS”, the low participation of youth in civil society and community organizations referred to lack of confidence in the ability of these organizations to make change; the political affiliations of these organizations which interfere with their ability to deliver their services efficiently, and the non-responsiveness of the programs operated by these organizations to the real interests of the communities in general and youth in particular. Results from the focus group with the teachers show the importance of implementing this project at schools, in which they said that it increased confidence among the students and they were aware of the surrounding problems. At the same time it has a great effect on the achievements of the students and on the school itself when visited by the local councils and participated in improving the environment.

For the human rights program: many indicators showed the importance of the intervention done at the school children level as they are the most marginalized group that are affected by occupational violation and cultural context. As a result of hard political, economic and social circumstances in Palestine, it is noticed that violation of human rights have increased in schools such as violence, children labor, dropouts and other issues.

Enrollment rate for girls in basic education is 94.4% and for boys it is 92.2%. However, in the secondary education, enrollment rates are much lower; 66.7% in general, which means that “a third of the youth of the official school age at secondary level (16-17 years old) are out of school”¹¹.

The percentage of school dropout in OPT is about 1.3% for males and 0.6% for females in elementary stage and 3.2 % for males and 3.3 % for females in the secondary stage.

The phenomenon of child labor is considered as global, but varying from country to country. With the high rate of poverty in Palestine, child labor became one of the threatened factors that could affect the social and economic levels. The PCBS shows that 4.1% from the total children ages (10-17) are working whether paid or unpaid, (7.5 %

⁹ USAID West Bank and Gaza Netham Project Summary Review and Evaluation of Civic Education programs, July, 2009

¹⁰the Status of Youth in Palestine- the Future is knocking report , “Sharek” ,2013.

¹¹ National Need Assessment Framework (Education Cluster, 2013)

males and 0.6 % females). Other PCBS report shows that there is about (65) thousand children in the age group (7-14 years) working in OPT, and more than 102 thousand children under the age of 18 years working in various businesses. ¹²The average of daily wage in NIS for children aged 10-17 years who work is 49.7 NIS and the weekly working hours are 44.5. The main causes are labor among males and early marriage among female students, in addition to disability causes and psychological or physical illness¹³. "School dropout is one of the most important issues to tackle at schools, because schools complain of low achievement rate, school dropout, child labor, and the lack of awareness among the parents regarding importance of education. At the same time high unemployment rate and inactivated labor Palestinian law". Hebron /supervisor

The percentage of females who married before the age of 18 is 21.9 % of the total marriages contracts in 2012. While the percentage of females who have been divorced before the age of 18 is 9.7 % of the total divorce cases in 2012.

Failure rates at elementary school level during 2011/2012 were 1.3 percent of males and 1.0 percent of females. At secondary level, the rate was 1.1 percent of males and 0.8 percent of females.

Result of PCBS survey (2011)¹⁴ showed that more than one third of the Palestinians with disabilities didn't receive any education (37.6%); the same survey also showed that one third of those who were enrolled in schools dropped out again. In addition, the report shows that 53.3% of the persons with disabilities in Palestine are illiterate. On the other hand Palestinian Ministry of Education reported in 2012 that 60% of the children with disabilities are not enrolled in education.¹⁵

Results from the focus group with teachers showed the importance of both programs at the level of students as this program strengthens the personality and improves the communication skills and at the same time can improve educational achievement, "this project was implemented for the past ten years in Jerusalem, we noticed the effect on the achievements for the students, that's why we feel it's important to continue with such a project "Abu Khaleel. The current situation reflects the need for urgent and continuous work in improving the educational status, and therefore the need for programs that targeted the three pillars of education the students, educational cadre

¹² PCBS 2014

¹³ PCBS 2014

¹⁴ PCBS (2011) Disability Survey: Report of Major Findings.

http://www.pcbs.gov.ps/Portals/_PCBS/Downloads/book1812.pdf

¹⁵ MoE (2012). My Right to Education: Unprivileged Groups. A paper presented in the Back to School Workshop in partnership between MoE & UNICEF.

and school environment. “The families and the students demanded to continue working in the dropout project as their communities in dire need for it “supervisor /Hebron.

Participation:

It is clearly noticed that TCC is working in a participatory approach with the partners in both programs, including but not limited to MoH, NGOs, local councils, municipalities, and the donors, with the MoE the TCC have a strategic relationship, in which they share the same mission and therefore strengthening this relation would empower the center to be one of the influenced body for educational sector. For both programs, MoE participated with TCC in selecting the targeted schools, in the training process and in implementation and evaluation of selected projects. At the same time the TCC team participated in studies and strategic plan of MoE, they are part of evaluation team, and review the curriculum .The beneficiaries and stakeholders participated with the design, planning implementation and evaluation of program activities. In the civic education project : the students were the main members in managing the citizenship and the social audit projects , through the process of identification and prioritizing the communities' problems ,that the students worked on , the local councils and CBOs were part of focus group at the beginning of the project, in addition an introductory workshop was conducted for more than 21 representatives from the local communities 'councils, municipalities, CBO's , school principals, to introduce and discuss the project activities. The TCC keep coordination and involve all stakeholders in the advocacy campaigns, PEC is a major partner in which all the members participated in all activities through programs or projects stages. At the same time different studies and evaluations were conducted to measure the achievements in participatory approach taking the beneficiaries' feedback into consideration in improving future programs.¹⁶

2. Efficiency:

Efficiency measures the balance between the input of resources (human and material) and the output. The two program's output were delivered according to the plans , while the evaluation team believe that financial and human resources were used efficiently . Efficient use of the budget was noticed through the achievements of the targeted activities and the no. of beneficiaries in the time allocated. At the same time the contribution of MOE in implementing the program's activities through participation of the trained teachers and supervisors in implementing the program's activities, and the coordination with the TCC staff allow to save time in achieving all the activities. While the contribution of the local communities with the projects implementation also reflect

¹⁶Refer to TCC for projects evaluations , and publications

efficient use of the money . at the management level TCC was able to use the human resource in an efficient manner through limited no. of staff (4 staff) .

2.1. Civic Education Program:

In 2014 the civic education program became constructed, conceptualized with clear objectives, there was a clear plan to target the direct and indirect beneficiaries to strengthen , empowered and armed them with the most effective methods to be able to work towards democratic society . In this section of the evaluation we tried to reflect the skills and knowledge that the educational cadre and the students gained as a direct beneficiaries, at the same time the strategies that was followed by TCC to mobilize the civil society in order to advocate for a just and democratic society .

2.1.1. Capacity building for educational cadre on civic education concepts:

There is a clear plan on how TCC is going to implement one of the most effective methodologies at the school level to achieve quality civic education called “action learning”. The plan started with providing the information and skills to the educational cadre (teachers, supervisors, and principals) so they will be able to transfer what they gained to the students with complete cooperation and participation from the local communities representing (the village councils, mayors and governorates). TCC is fully aware of the importance of involving different stakeholders to be able to gain the support and to be part of the civic education process. The teachers integrated the theoretical with practical training to empower the students to work on different projects /initiatives that tackle realistic and sensitive issues about the educational sector or from the communities.

More than 300 educational stakeholders including teachers, supervisors, and school principals in the MoH and UNRWA schools received the concept of civic education training, in addition to conducting awareness sessions to parents, local communities, and members from CBOs, CSOs, and media.

Two different training fields were planned to be conducted for the educational cadre in the targeted schools related to civic education, one is the citizenship and the second is the social audit. The students were supposed to work on two initiatives for each field.

Citizenship training: 22 contemporary issues teachers (6 female and 6 male) and principals/ supervisors received a TOT on "project citizen methodology" which included the topics of democracy, civil society principles, development approaches, and problem solving techniques. In addition to the methodology of youth engagement, the same group received a follow up TOT workshop to emphasize their knowledge, where they discussed the student's work on the projects.

Social Audit(SA) training :32 teachers and 12 supervisors , 13 principals (34 M , 23 F)

received training on the concepts of social audit , the supervisors trained on concepts of corruption, anti- corruption, accountability, transparency, responsibility and arbitration of student's projects and acting as members of the arbitration team as they are going to work directly with the students. The economic and computer science teachers in 16 directorates trained on concepts of anti-corruption education and social audit project methodology. Principals received the awareness and knowledge on anti-corruption education concepts so that they will support the supervisors and teachers' implementation of (SA) in their schools. At the end of the training the teachers and supervisors will be able to train the students on the way of research and discovery ,data collection , analysis , decision making , and team work in addition teachers will provide the students with the skills of selecting priority projects, how to learn about policies and laws, how to study projects' documentation and how to conduct audits and do accountability sessions and public hearings sessions., the teachers / supervisors are supposed to provide the students with tools to monitor and evaluate local governorate councils. The preparation and training process took place in 2014, while the actual work on the projects will take place in 2015 in which 16 school principals supported the implementation of 16 social audit projects in their schools. This training will empower the students (the decision makers in the future) to protect the Palestinian society 'interests as one of their role in the society.

Regarding the training material the evaluation team noticed that TCC used the scientific, approved strategy to conduct the TOT training that focused on action learning in which the teachers provided the student with the training throughout the project. This strategy gives the students the big role and allows the teacher to play the facilitator role away from dictating. The student practices the information rather than using the paper and pens route. This method will provide the students with critical and analytical thinking; strengthen the communication and problem solving skills. , This strategy also will allow the student to participate in planning, designing and have a big role in implementing the project and not only be the recipient of information.

Results from the evaluation report done in 2014 for the " citizenship project " was based on pre / post , which showed that there is an increase of the teachers' knowledge regarding the concepts of democracy , principles of civil society , crises management .There was significant improvement on how to design action plans , and to prioritize community problems and plan for advocacy campaign. Also the teachers stated at the same evaluation that more time is needed for such training¹⁷. on the other hand, the focus groups with teachers and interview with supervisors and principals showed that

¹⁷ evaluation report :civic project 2014

they gained the skills of : communication with the local communities , and they knew how to shift from dictating style to action learning method. They gained the capacity on how to transfer the skills of critical and analytical thinking, problem solving and advocacy skills to their students.” we gained the knowledge and skills of: action learning skills, we became aware of what social audit means, we knew how to practice team work with the students, and how to help the students to become pioneers” supervisor /interview / Jenin. Taking into consideration that the training for the last year (2014) focused on how “project citizen methodology “related to Palestinian Disability Right (PDR), and how to encourage the integration of persons with disability in the Palestinian society.

2.1.2. Capacity building for students on civic education :

As part of the training, two different projects were planned to be implemented by the school for children under the supervision of the teachers/supervisors in the targeted schools. Over 15500 Palestinian students in 30 schools in the West Bank received the knowledge and skills from the educational cadre who received the civic education and human right and social audit training.

As a result of citizenship training eleven youth students forum were formed in 11 schools, 336 students (167 females /169 males) join the forum. The purpose of the forum is to empower the students and give them the chance to practice the concept of citizenship concerning participation , responsibility , equality and dignity in the Palestinian society .Providing the students the opportunity to practice what they gained from the in class training, the teachers implemented an action learning project , in which the students have to choose a problem from their surroundings and analyze it jointly with the teachers and present the results in front of the local communities. Eleven citizenship projects were accomplished that tackled the most obvious problems among the youth and in the communities such as low academic achievements , drug abuse , overcrowding of schools ,school dropout rate, and others . For evaluation purposes for the citizenship projects, 20 local arbitration sessions took place with participation of representatives from the local communities, and the importance of inviting the decision maker people to participate in the feedback for the work of the students, and to be aware of the youths needs and participate in solving any possible problem. The result of the evaluation for the citizenship project showed an increase of knowledge and skills among students who participated in the union as a result of practicing what they gained class.¹⁸For the success projects to be benefited and shared with the stakeholders, and for the TCC to be able to transfer the experience in a more professional manner to other

¹⁸ evaluation report :civic project 2014

students, a booklet was developed, printed and published which included all the projects.

Regarding the social audit projects , 480 students (including more than 250 female students) from the 11th grades in 16 schools implementing the Social Audits Methodology , 18 public, UNRWA and private schools, participated in the initiatives. They selected projects from official places such as the village council that are being implemented or were completed a year ago. , The students supposed to advocate any change in the project if any problems were found. These projects will continue to be implemented during 2015.As a result of social audit training, the students gained the knowledge and skills related to Democratic Governance, Civil Society principles, development approaches, Community-Driven Development « CDD », youth and governance, crisis management and developmental problems-solving techniques. The result of the focus group with the students who participated with the social audit projects showed that after implementing the projects they gained the skills of: “strengthening their personalities, team work, the use of statistical analysis system, monitoring of the plans, and communication skills like dialogue”, we believe that this experience will expose the students to notice and analyze a corruption phenomena at their communities. Working with the initiatives enhanced understanding and respect of values related to responsibility, integrity and transparency among the Palestinian children in order to prepare them in the future to stand against corruption in their society. The result of the focus group with the teachers showed that the students gained the skills of writing , speech , summarizing , listening , conversation , discussion ,in addition to computer skills .While the result of the students focus group showed that the students became aware about the importance of social audit for the projects that run by the municipalities, and the importance of community accountability toward the municipalities ‘ work .To spread the results of the projects , the media was used through developing a short cartoon film reflecting the aim of the project , and TV seminars discussing teaching anti-corruption values to young students.

2.1.3. Involvement of stakeholders and decision maker in citizenship education

Community participation is an asset for the projects and initiatives to achieve its goals.TCC used the participatory approach through the implementation process for the different projects in the targeted communities ,different stakeholders were part of development and evaluation of the project .The citizenship project conducted 22 workshops that targeted members of the youth unions, males and females, with representatives from the local communities including CBOs , local governance , decision

makers , to discuss the results of the projects. We believe that the community and the stakeholder's participation will give the students the power and self-confidence, in addition to having the ability to change, in which this can implant the spirit of citizenship. On the other hand the decision makers can recognize the ability of the students to work in such projects .An educational national conference was conducted with the involvement of more than 300 educational stakeholders so that they could participate and recognize the ability of the students to work in such a project and give them the support. The attendance included teachers, educational supervisors, experts, academic institutions, MoE, UNRWA Education Office, parents, parents' councils, local communities, CBOs, CSOs, private sector and media.

2.2. Efficiency of Human Right Program:

In 2014 a clear mission was formalized for the human rights program and it was the first time that it was implemented as an independent program with clear goals. TCC with collaboration with PEC played an active role at the national side to advocate for EFA .this demands the Palestinian government to provide rehabilitation for schools and educational institutions to become more inclusive and accessible for persons with disability , allocate sufficient budgets for education to allow development in education for persons with disabilities ,prepare plans for teacher qualification for teaching persons with disabilities ,approve inclusive policies for educational institutions ,sensitization of curricula to disability issues, improve provision of information and indicators on disability issues , and ensure implementation of legislations pertaining to needs of persons with disabilities in the educational environment. More work is recommended to be done at this level, with more involvement from the NGOs, CBOs, in addition to GO institutions.

2.2.1. Advocacy toward increased public spending on education& Global campaigns for EFA :

The Palestinian Education Coalition played an active role toward mobilizing the civil society for more budgets to be saved for education through different advocacy campaigns. , The most obvious in 2014 was the activities of the GAW , in which PEC demands the Palestinian government to provide rehabilitation for schools and educational institutions to become more inclusive and accessible for persons with disabilities , allocate sufficient budgets for education to allow development in education for persons with disabilities ,prepare plans for teacher qualification for teaching persons with disabilities ,approve inclusive policies for educational institutions ,sensitization of

curricula to disability issues, improve provision of information and indicators on disability issues, and ensure implementation of legislations pertaining to needs of persons with disabilities in the educational environment. A central demonstration was organized within GAW 2014, the PEC in cooperation with the General Union of Palestinians with Disability. The campaign highlighted a specific message in demanding "inclusive educational institutions by 2020". At the end of the march a letter of demand was submitted to the Palestinian Prime Minister and to Palestinian Legislative Council and another letter to the Council members. Dr. Mustafa Barghouti, PLC member, demanded adequate budgets for inclusion in schools and educational institutions, commitment to the UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, and allocation of an adequate budget from the PNA's budget to achieve the alignment and adaptation of educational institutions to be able to include persons with disabilities.

To strengthen the role of PEC, 15 representative members participated in a training workshop aimed at providing the participants with advocacy tools and focused mainly on the disability rights. Several advocacy activities were prepared and conducted with full coordination with PEC during 2014. One of the advocacy campaigns targeted some of the most influential people at the community level "the religious persons", to talk about the rights of persons with disabilities at mosques and churches. We believe that this is one of the most effective methodologies that can be used to change attitudes and behaviors, as they are the most respected and convincing people in the communities. TCC with cooperation with PEC prepared numbers of a research paper to be used in the advocacy activities such as: a paper that describe the status of persons with disability in MENA countries, while another prepared at the national level, and one more research paper were prepared to describe the impact of the Israeli occupation on education in Gaza strip. In addition several workshops and meetings have been conducted between TCC, PEC and various stakeholders discussing the impact of education privatization, progress towards achieving EFA goals, program of GAW 2014 in Palestine. Some meetings were held with representatives from MoE, UNRWA and PRCS as active bodies representing education and disability rights in Palestine. As an evaluation team, we believe that such meetings and workshops that involve different stakeholders will contribute to achieving the goals of the program and enrich the design and implementation of an advocacy campaign that supports EFA.

During a press conference held in Ramallah, the PEC tried to send a message to the Palestinian Authority regarding discrimination of disabilities. They were requesting from the Authority to implement some measures that improve the accessibility of disabled people to education, PEC demanded the Palestinian government improve the

school environment to fit persons with disabilities, increase the budget for development of education for the students with disability, qualify the educational cadre to be able to teach persons with disability, and ensure implementation of legislatives pertaining the needs of PWD.

2.2.2. Submission of draft policy recommendation supporting PDRL :

With the Higher Council in 2013 it was agreed to develop a draft of recommendations including the ministers' policies regarding PWD. With the participation of 22 representative heads of branches, in 2014 a meeting was held between different partners to revise the recommendation, and was distributed to different stakeholders for feedback, and finalization.

- **Promotion of educational and social inclusion of women , men , boys and girls without gender and /or disability among communities , teachers , children and youth**

2.2.3. Capacity building for the GUPWD members in right of PWD

In 2014, a 3-day training workshop on the knowledge and skills of project cycle management and fundraising was implemented with the involvement of 40 participants (21 in West Bank and 19 in Gaza, 19 female and 17 male participants). The participants included the young GUPWD members with various types of disability. The training focused on skills in planning, fundraising, managing and evaluating initiatives and projects. In addition, the training focused on building disability-sensitive budgets and managing projects' budgets. During the training, the participants drafted plans for project ideas and kept developing those plans throughout the training exercises' period. We believe that choosing these skills to provide training for, is very important for persons to build their confidence, confrontation, persuasion, and lobbying as basics for how to write projects and plan for advocacy work. For more effective communication with deaf people. Another important training workshop conducted for the GUPWD members was sign language training for 30-hour, where (18 females and 12 males) benefited from this training. This training will allow for effective communication with those persons who cannot speak. They also received a book for sign language learning as a reference for the future. We believe that this can give the disabled the chance to express their feelings freely in front of people who can understand their needs. This is one of the important activities that can be used to work toward rights of people with disabilities.

2.2.4. Advocate toward implementing new policies supporting PDRL

Under the advocacy campaign that aimed at supporting rights of persons with disability, many activities have been conducted by TCC with cooperation of PEC, such as marches, demonstrations, awareness workshops and others: 5 marches were organized in 5 big cities in the West Bank. A central demonstration was held in Ramallah city organized by PEC with cooperation with GUPWD, with the participation of more than 300 persons with disabilities, students, teachers, and some members from Palestinian Legislative Council. Another two demonstrations, one in Nablus and the other in Jenin, demanding equal rights and equal opportunities for persons with disability. In addition different activities were organized and implemented by the PEC member's organizations such as: recreational activities, development of films, marathons, media seminars, awareness workshops with the families, and others. We believe that involving different organizations in such activities can promote, support and increase the awareness of the right of PWD. At the same time it can widen the circle of the organization that became aware of the importance of the campaigns that aimed at development of policies that support PWD. Another booklet was developed as an advocacy tool which included quotations of 40 public figures and leaders in the Palestinian society supporting the rights of PWD. TCC also used one of the most powerful resource in Palestine, the media, where they targeted 15 local journalists to empower in the field of rights for PWD, The goal is they will be able to cover the campaigns that advocate for RFE for the PWD.

Another achievement toward supporting PDRL is the development of the draft of the GUPWD National Strategy & Action Plan that will facilitate implementation of PDRL .The strategy was accomplished with cooperation with different stakeholders. The strategy analyzed the strengths and weaknesses of GUPWD, and identified priorities and set advocacy goals. In 2014 marked the development of a booklet which gathered 45 quotes and was published under the title "They Said: Our Rights and The Leaders' Promises". This booklet will be used as an advocacy tool.

At the same time TCC continues to work toward conducting advocacy visits to officials and leaders of public institutions, leaders of the Palestinian Education Coalition member organizations and leaders of the disability sector stakeholders.

2.2.5. Capacity building for educational cadre on human right values

Discrimination of human rights in our society requires joint efforts at different levels. Providing the teachers with knowledge and skills of human rights value can be one of the instruments that can used to advocate for equality among achievements. Throughout the human rights program 600 teachers in 30 vulnerable targeted communities have received awareness sessions on human rights education. The training

equipped them with knowledge and skills related to child rights, law of child labor, and the institutions that support child rights. In addition they acquired the skills of communication, speech, presentation and discussion, where the teachers will be able to transfer the knowledge and skills to their students. The students gained the knowledge and skills of children rights, the structure of the Legislative Council, its function and mission, and they also obtained knowledge of operating national and international conventions and declarations protecting various rights especially those related to children. They received the necessary skills required to implement campaigns that targeted child rights issues such as school dropout and child labor .One of the effective methodologies used at the class level –to provide youth sensitization sessions with the participation of youth leaders of GUPWD, students with disability from private schools and disability organizations. These sessions gave the students the chance to practice the skills they need to advocate for human rights, and made the students realize that they can join discussions with the disabled students where an increase of their awareness of the rights of PWD .At the same time students expressed a large amount of interaction with activities that have been implemented throughout the sessions. These sessions included: sign instruction by deaf students, wheelchair tennis and running competitions with students with disabilities, games with all students covering their eyes and receiving instruction from their classmates (imitating what it would be like to have a visual disability), psychosocial support activities, panel discussions with youth/adults with disabilities on their experiences, challenges & needs, and oral presentations, songs and films presentations “we gained the skills of conducting interview , persuasive skill , speech and presentation , positive competition , ability to do films , internet skills , team work , listening skill “,focus group with students.

2.2.6. School dropout initiatives

School dropout is considered one of the most common problems that affect the educational process, as well as the increased percentage of other phenomena that affects future generations the child labor. Under a 3 years project titled “**fighting child labor** “ , the TTC succeeded toward reducing the no. of drop out students , while the result of the evaluation for the same project showed the amazing results ¹⁹ , as this evaluation focused on 2014 , we prefer not to repeat what was done by other colleagues , while to highlight the impact of the project which was reflected on the annual report 2014 , it was clear that the school dropout one school year before the project started 2012 -2013 calculated in 7 schools as (191 case) 70% of them were male , while the no of cases who returned to school at the same year was (11) represent 6% from the drop out

¹⁹ Evaluation of the “ fighting child labor on oPt “

cases . while in the academic year 2013 – 2014 after the project started the drop out cases in the same schools reached 164 students 70% male , in the same year the TCC succeeded in making 43 of them return to school which represent (26%) of the drop out cases , (16 % are female and 86% male) , this reflect an increase of 20 % compared to previous year . The educational cadre mainly teachers and school councilors intended to work on reducing child labor by working directly with students who left or intended to leave the school and to contact with their families, they also targeted the employers who violated child rights through work. The teachers and supervisors participated in different activities with the students and the families to decrease school dropout rates. They began with raising the awareness for school children, supporting their academic achievements and their psychological wellbeing .The councilors conducted a total of 119 sessions in 7 schools, for more than 2138 students regarding information and discussion about child labor. They also worked with 385 parents within awareness workshops. The workshops focused on the laws and policies that support education and limit child labor, at the same time remedial classes was held for students to improve their academic achievements and encourage them to remain in school. For the media to be able to reflect the unknown reasons behind child labor and to spread the true picture about child labor they should be aware of the causes of child labor phenomena. To provide awareness to these groups, TCC organized a training for 40 Journalists from different media organizations (20 female, 20 male participants).The training sessions focused on the dangers of child labor, so that they were well prepared and able to present these materials about this phenomena in Palestine through their work in the media .

2.2.7. Restoration of the normal socio-academic performance for children

This activity come under the project titled “remedial classes for children in West Bank and Gaza”, to improve the socio-academic status for (852/children (363 M ,489F) from 10 targeted communities ,in the 2ed , 3ed and 4th grade who have a very low academic level .Capacity building was done for (40) female school teachers and counselors in the targeted neighborhoods , 6 training workshops (3 in WB, 3in Gaza), the training focused on diagnosing and counteracting cognitive and socio-emotional learning challenges including psychological symptoms associated with war-related trauma of Palestinian children, providing the participants with skills on how to differentiate between learning difficulties and low academic achievements and how to cope with each from psychosocial and educational perspectives. They were also introduced to the most common behavioral problems school children suffer from and the role of counselors in solving them , at the same time trainees were introduced to innovative and effectives

teaching methodologies of English and Arabic ,the training followed by several follow up workshops .

At the family level (1513)parents “including 1377 mothers” participated in (58)raising awareness psycho- education workshops to provide them with information and skills on how to interact with their children and help them emotionally and academically .At the same time therapeutic & entertainment Camps were held for the children as a recreational activities that would enhance the psychological status of the children and therefore improve their interest for better academic achievements, in which two camps a month were held for each of the targeted student group that included recreational, developmental and educational activities.

3. Effectiveness:

3.1. Effectiveness of Civic education program:

This section measures to what extent the project objectives and goals were reached. As a result of the analysis of the project documents, and the data driven from the focus groups and the interviews for the civic education program, we conclude that the objectives of the program were highly achieved. The Program was able to establish a system of citizenship and human rights value within the educational system.

3.1.1. The ability of the educational cadre to implement a more established system of citizenship and human rights value

The evaluation team appreciated the systematic scientific strategy that TCC used to integrate the concepts of civic education with the learning process at the targeted schools. These include: first using the official curriculum , in which the teachers integrated the skills and information in the official /mandatory materials usually taken in this grade mainly the contemporary issues , the civil material and the economic; second using the hidden curriculum that provide the students with values and trends through their interaction with their teachers , families and with the civil institutions; and third using the unofficial curriculum through joining the forums at their schools in which they practice the election process , participated in decision making in addition to voluntary work. We believe that this is the most effective way of learning. As a result of the training received, the educational cadre gained the capabilities to practice the knowledge and skills attained at their work position. The teachers and supervisors integrated the method of action learning into their manner of training. They advocated for civic education and project citizenship through direct participation with the students, and monitoring and evaluation. They provided the students with skills and tools to design analyze and implement the projects of citizenship and social audit.

Practicing the action learning methodology provided them the chance to convert from the dictating method to active learning where they were able to communicate effectively with people from the external environment regarding the selected projects. Principals promoted the positive change at their school's environment and implemented quality initiatives addressing school problems, in which they allowed and participated in implementing the projects, advocating and supporting the implementation of (11) the project related to citizenship by teachers and their students at the school level. This reflects the positive effect of the training that the principals received, and their persistence of the importance of implementing such a project in their schools. "We succeeded in institutionalizing the civic education curriculum at schools and all related policies concerning the curriculum, the teachers and the training methodology, and working towards the institutionalizing of the social audit ".the general director/TCC.

3.1.2. Ability of children and youth to practice citizenship values :

The students gained the knowledge and skills and positive attitudes to be able to apply innovative creative projects /initiatives addressing community issues specifically in the disability field as active citizens producing change. They became more active in promoting a just and democratic society. The Palestinian children who participated in the social audit initiatives were able to use the knowledge and skills to monitor and evaluate public policies and officials in a way that reflect accountability and responsibility. Results from the focus group with the teachers revealed that the students were able to practice team work, they gained the ability to communicate with the external environment, they were also able to discuss, negotiate and persuade .In order to be able to implement the projects in a more systematized way, the students used the strategy that they trained on, in which they established (11) forums to work on the projects. The effect of the forums was clear in different areas, the students practiced the new vocabulary that they gained at the ground, they practiced transparency through the announcement for elections for the forums members, and by introducing the roles and responsibilities of the forums. They were able to design and develop posters, banners, booklets and distribute them to the students to be elected. At the same time the students' youth forums were able to develop scientific developmental plans for the projects they chose, (11) and plans were accomplished. The student gained the capabilities to select problems and prioritize them, identify project objectives, review laws related to issue, develop the action plan, project activities, and project results. On the other hand there was an effect of action training through the citizenship and the

social audit projects, in which the students were able to understand, analyze, present solutions, and advocate for youth problems in their communities. They were able to negotiate and debate with people from the local communities and decision makers regarding sensitive issues and needs of their communities,” the initiatives helped the students to recognize the social mobility and the community institutions “ “one of the students told me : today I’m ready to talk in front of the prime minster” Imad /teacher / focus group. Therefore, and as a result of the skills they gained through these initiatives, some of the students left to Qatar to participate in a speech. “The initiatives built the direct relationship between the students and accountable persons from the civil society and spirit of volunteerism,” interview with supervisor Fadi Khaleel. The table below demonstrates the most significant effects of the citizenship projects that were developed by the students, at the student’s and school’s level.

At the students level	At the school level
Promotion of team work	Preparing a group of students who can write scientific research
Promotion of Patriotism and the spirit of belonging to the village	Strengthening the relationship with the local community
Introducing students to the problems in their schools and towns and participate in solving them	Proposing the problems to the related authorities to participate in solving them
Strengthening the students personality to propose the problems in a civilized way , and Increase self - confidence , creativity, leadership and responsibility	Promotion of Team work
Knowledge of the difficulties and problems faced by youth such as (drug addict, drop out of schools) and Contributing in helping youth to avoid problems.	Raising the school level and achieving a good ranking

At the end of the project the teachers acknowledged that the students’ achievements were improved compared to the previous semester due to competition among the students. They requested to implement the same methodology for the rest of the curriculum (teachers /focus group) .During the interview with the supervisor who participated in the social audit projects, he stated that he noticed that the students gained the leading role skills, in which they gained confidence and were able to speak in

public through media. They gained the ability to conduct interviews with important people such as the mayor, local councils, they were also able to implement the accountability role, and follow up the plan that was designed with the supervisor.

3.1.3. Establishment and activation of dialogue among stakeholders regarding goals, approaches, methods, and obstacles of citizenship and human rights education.

The programs succeeded in increasing the sensitivity of decision makers toward youth issues and priorities of target villages to a large degree. , The civic education program succeeded in conducting effective fruitful community dialogue presenting the results of the projects and the possibility of contribution for solving the problems based on the alternatives the students suggested, (20 dialogue with a total of 789 community members, youth and teachers).Forum member were able to conduct an effective dialogue between two different groups (male versus female). While two accountability workshops were held with the participation of youth forums, CBOs, local councils, Governors and local media. These workshops had their effect on the student's personality in which they gained awareness in that they have the capacity to conduct community based accountability issues. It had its effect on the decision makers where they learned that the youth can have effective input in the developmental process.

At the community level, implementing citizenship projects with coordination and participation from local communities allowed to strengthen the relationship between the schools and the decision makers at the local level. , Therefore supporting the schools as a result of the projects completed where both teachers and students were able to advocate and dialogue for effective and sustainable alternatives identified through the development process of the projects. As a result of dialogue there were a number of achievements due to community support, some of these achievements include the success that the forums in Mazra Qeblya accomplished, as they were able to convince the mayor to donate a piece of land to establish a recreational and cultural community center for the youth in general and for young women in specific. They were also able to influence the Ramallah Governor who promised to follow up fundraising for the actual implementation of this project. Other achievements include: building of a school in AbuDees, this was a result of the project done by the students which discussed the problem of school overcrowding. The village council admired the fact that this was due to students work on the project. Other achievements that were established were a library, creation of school play grounds in Aleezariah School, while in Qibia School transportation was insured for the students, improvement of the school environment such as school shades, and painting of the school. In Beat Liqia / Ramallah construction

of school wall accomplished by the village council .It was calculated that the communities participated in 32 % of fixing the problem.

3.2. Effectiveness of Human right program :

TCC with the cooperation of PEC, and other partners worked toward mobilizing the civil society to work for changing government policies toward achieving EFA goals, and the promotion of educational and social inclusion of women, men, boys and girls without gender and or disability as a result of the advocacy campaigns at the national, global, and institutional level. There is no clear effect on the policies regarding EFA due to the many challenges that are out of anyone's control.

The ability of the civil society to participate in changing government policies related to spending on education, and toward achieving EFA goals:

3.2.1. Ability of advocacy campaigns to change government policies related to spending on education and EFA goals :

As a result of the advocacy campaigns at the national, global, and institutional level that aimed at increasing public spending on education ,achieving EFA goals ,and supporting women's right ,many achievements have been noticed. The work on these issues needs to be continued with intensive efforts from the governmental and nongovernmental organizations. The general director:"We are in the beginning of having an effect on the people, we were able to have an effect on the policies of the ministry of education". The PEC continues to work effectively toward achieving the EFA goals. They worked toward identification of the main messages for GAW (Global Action Week) 2014 "towards inclusive educational institutions by 2020 in Palestine", and they created the first draft action plan of GAW 2014 within the advocacy approach that they received training. It was noticed that GAW 2014 was rich with a variety of activities that targeted all locations and addressed persons with disability, children, parents, teachers, community activities and decision makers.

At the same time as a result of advocacy activities of the TCC with cooperation with PEC and with other stakeholders toward improving educational situation, effective results have been achieved regarding reaching EFA goals. PEC succeeded to expand the circle of the Palestinian organization that joined the advocacy campaign during GAW, such as PRCS, Rehabilitation Department/ UNRWA, YMCA, Yasmeeen Association for Children with Intellectual Disabilities, Consultative Staff for Development of NGOs in addition to some of the refugee camps' disability committees and support groups. Additionally, TCC

could mobilize formal bodies to allow for implementing related activities such as MoE to implement the activities at schools, and Ministry of Waqf and Religion Affairs to implement the speeches in the mosques and churches. In addition to mobilizing other governmental bodies to participate in the activities such as the Palestinian Legislative Council and ministry of social affairs, participation of these institutions will contribute in pushing toward equal education regardless of gender and disability and therefore achieving EFA.

The PEC with GUPWD succeeded in sitting down with members from the PLC and presenting the demands toward EFA, and PWD. They were able to convince them to work despite the deactivation. PLC members ensured that accountability and implementation of laws and policies is their responsibility and they will work toward it, as well as ensuring approval of budgets that are responsive to peoples' needs would be a priority. They also ensured that they will work with Employment Bureau to ensure implementation of the minimum 5% quota of employment for persons with disabilities, that support the implementation of PDRL.

As an effect of the advocacy demonstrations that called for equal rights and equal opportunities for persons with disability, some of the decision makers personalities welcomed the activities and showed the support for rights for PWD in which Ms. Anan Atyreh, the Deputy Governor /Nablus, stated that the Governorate supports the demands to reformulate government's policies and decisions to ensure full adherence to the legislations of rights of persons with disability, especially the right to inclusive education. While Jenin Governor, General Talal Dwaikat, welcomed the demonstration and gave a speech to the participant institutions supporting them for their effort.

3.2.2. Implementation of draft policy recommendation supporting PDRL :

As a result of advocating toward implementing the new policies supporting PDRL, we noticed that TCC worked hard with different stakeholders and decision makers at the community and authority level to achieve development of policies that could support PDRL. As follow up activities for the previous years, two meetings were held with the new Minister of Social Affairs and a second follow up meeting was organized with the ministry of Local Governance; as a result of these meetings draft of recommendations of policies were submitted to the Higher Council of Persons with Disability, and the same recommendations were submitted to Ministries of Education, Labor and Health, Thus, the ministries committed to use the recommendations for their work on developing each ministry's policies.

The ability of educational and social inclusion of women, men, boys and girls without gender and disabilities:

3.2.3. Ability of GUPWD members to advocate for right of PWD

For effective empowerment and participation of PWD in the educational and social life, and as a result of the capacity building received by GUPWD members in right of PWD, they were able to conduct 13 workshops in WB by 26 PWD who received the training, 64 % of which were female. They were able to drive the discussion regarding negative attitude towards persons with disability and their rights for implementation of PDRL on ground based of their own experience. The ability of PWD to conduct such a workshop reflected the success of the training they received. Another example was the effect of the advocacy PWD's committee that worked on a specific campaign to activate monitoring on public schools to ensure inclusion of children with disability. The same committee designed two surveys one to measure violations against children with disability in schools and the other is to collect information from local organizations that document such cases .One of the major effects that could be seen in2014 is the development of GUPWD National advocacy strategic plan in participation of different stakeholders. This strategy can play a big role toward educational and social inclusion of women, men, boys and girls without gender and disability if implemented and monitored by the relevant people. During the meeting PEC and GUPWD with members from PLC promised to work towards the improvement of school environment and toward a rights-based amendment of the laws and policies to achieve inclusion. As a result of media training, 10 radio episodes were produced on a local station called women FM under the title of "Leading the Change". Rights of persons with disabilities were addressed during the program in the form of dialogue between guests who represent different stakeholders and responsible bodies regarding each of the raised topics.

One of the other achievements regarding PWD , is the approval of providing two public places with ramps at the entrances to facilitate access of persons with disability to be implemented in 2015 .As a result of an agreement was signed between TCC, GUPWD and the local governance bodies in different locations in West Bank (8 local authorities , Bethlehem Municipality, Beit Ummar Municipality, Harres Village Council, Qalqilia Municipality, Arram Municipality, Jericho Municipality, Thaheryieh Municipality and Toubas Municipality). As a result of advocacy visits and meetings with many

representatives and decision makers, many effects were noticed that will lead to implementation of PDRL such as:

Collection of 45 pre-developed arguments & quotes from community leaders addressing misconceptions and myths regarding people with disabilities
Mobilization of Director General of Police to facilitate mobility of persons with disability in streets
Adoption of the recommendations that resulted from the conference that support PWD and integrating them within the work of Minister of Social Affairs and its committees
Commitment of the Head of Children Labor Department about the age 15 not 18 in terms of labor and relevant laws
Al-Istiqlal University agree to implement the “sign language” as a compulsory course for their students
MoEHE assured that schools can enroll students with physical, partial hearing and visual disabilities, and exclude students with intellectual and full hearing disabilities because of lack of specialized professionals in schools on regular bases
The Employment Bureau has started reserving 5% of all job vacancies in public institutions for qualified persons with disabilities
Approval of updating the protective services provided in the MoH including early diagnosis, vaccines, tests during pregnancy, child health care programs and school health programs

3.2.4. Ability of educational cadre to transfer and integrate the concepts of human right

As a result of capacity building for the educational cadre on human right values, they are able to implement and integrate human rights value in their curriculum and transfer the knowledge and skills to their students. The teachers transfer the skills they gained to their students in classrooms, 1810 boys and 2336 girls received 142 learning days on rights of persons with disabilities and have become more aware on how to advocate for them. They also gained the knowledge and skills that empower them to work for projects that benefit PWD. Results from the evaluation that was conducted in 2014 of the "Palestinians with disabilities catalyzing change" Project showed that the students who participated with the project gained the knowledge and skills about the rights of the disabled people and will transfer this experience to the surrounding environment. , 95.7% of the sample said that they will encourage others to do similar projects while 100 % of the same sample said that they are willing to participate in projects in the

future to enhance the circumstances of PWD in their societies and schools.²⁰ The students who worked on projects/initiatives that targeted PWD gained the ability to design and implement projects specifically for disabled people such as: magic stick for the blind, smart wheel chair, Harmonized public gardens for PMD and others.²¹

3.2.5. Decrease students dropout :

Under the project titled “ fighting child labor “ , another initiative that the students worked on is reducing school dropout. As an effect of the training, the students, local community members, teachers, principals and counselors became able to work on action learning initiatives, campaigns and counseling to reduce school dropout cases, in which students organized visits to the families of children who dropped out. They also conducted awareness activities, they met with the employers of children in their region, and the students also were able to implement a psychosocial support program to reintegrate students whose parents’ were convinced to return to school with cooperation from their teachers. They practiced their role as active citizens to effectively monitor and evaluate public policies in terms of Children’s rights by addressing community and school problems related to child labor .The result of this project and where they succeeded to reintegrate some of the cases to school, and to involve others with vocational work . They also increased academic achievement among children who participated in the remedial classes , and the local communities asked for more remedial classes for different age groups. This reflects the success of the work done for this group of students and demonstrates the involvement of local communities and the improvement of the educational process with the schools.²²

Success stories for school dropout:

S.KH .was a regular male student in Ruqa’a secondary school, he left the school for three months in 2014 due to family hardship where he was forced to work due to poverty and other family issues.The school supervisor followed up this case by visiting the family, speaking with the father and convincing him that his son should complete at least the current grade level. The school provided him with the stationary needed and he was able to return to school and finish they school year.

Z.Abu. F. male student was in the 9th grade, with low academic achievement, he used to hate school, and he preferred fixing cars, electricity, and other mechanical work. The supervisor followed up this case and, realized that this student can be innovative in the vocational training, now he is a regular student in a vocational school.

²⁰"Palestinians with disability catalyzing change" ProjectEvaluation Report2015

²¹ See report of project "Palestinians with disability catalyzing change"

²² Annual report 2014 TCC

Working on school dropout did not only benefit the targeted student, but also provide the supervisors who worked on the project with the skills of team work to be able to deal with all students. They also practiced project management on real cases. At the students level many were able to practice communication and documentation skills. “We were able to produce documentary film, and able to participate and complete presentations in the final conference, and were able to complete interviews with very important persons,” students focus group. Results from the focus group with the teachers and supervisors , showed that working with school dropout project has promoted the relationship with the local communities, and communication between students was more effective through the “ child to child approach “.The students became aware of social problems in their communities , the “ treatment classes” were very effective in improving students achievements , and it gave the university students the chance to be involved in giving these classes . The media also played an effective role in advocating for the right of the child for education, in which three radio seminars were produced and published discussing child labor and the roles of ministry of labor and civil society in applying monitoring and the accountability on laws that pertain to child labor. In addition to a radio spot that was produced and published on the local radio station and was broadcasted more than 100 times. Additional 500 copies of posters were published that reflected messages against child labor completed by the students themselves.

3.2.6. Improvement of the socio – academic level of children

The project was able to reduce cognitive and socio-emotional learning challenges among Palestinian children that reflected in improvement in their academic achievements .The teachers who participated in the capacity building sessions involved in the remedial classes , they became able to diagnose cognitive and socio-emotional symptoms including that caused by war- related trauma specially for children in Gaza strip ,they practiced debriefing sessions for the children who complained of PTSD such as depression , anxiety , isolation ,and other related symptoms . Results of monthly plans and reports provided by all teachers and counselors showed that 85% of target teachers and counselors could successfully develop cognitive and socio-emotional intervention plans to meet individual and group learning needs of target children and 80% of them could effectively utilize the plans during the remedial classes and the therapy camps. At the same time the parents became able to manage their children’s cognitive and socio-emotional learning challenges .

There was a significant improvement on the academic status for the targeted children which reflect the success of the intervention delivered by the project team ,result of evaluation done by the project staff showed that At least 70% of target students enjoyed enhanced socio-emotional status,75% of target students obtained higher grades in mathematics, Arabic and English ,60% of target students obtained “Pass” grades in mathematics, Arabic and English, the table below showed the difference in the academic status before and after the intervention for grade 2,3,4 for the three most difficult subjects :

Subject performance	School formal averages		Remedial Classes' assessment results	
	Before intervention	After intervention	Before intervention	After intervention
Arabic	47	72	31	72
English	48	70	36	67
Math	50	72	38	77
Average	49	71	35	72
Difference	↑22		↑37	

Monitoring and Evaluation:

We believe that TCC used effective methods for project monitoring and evaluation that were used during the implementations of the activities and can continue to be used for improvement and modification of activities, and drive the lessons learned for future interventions. For monitoring different tools were used such as: the daily, monthly and annual reports, the field visits with written feedback, in addition to regular meetings with the staff and with the beneficiaries. TCC encouraged the partners to follow the same methodology, for example GUPWD conducted about 120 visits to schools, meeting with the students and teachers and ensuring that the students initiatives are in line with the objectives. For evaluation purposes, they used pre / post test, for the training sessions to measure the increase in knowledge and change in practices, while the trainers were evaluated by the trainees concerning training materials and methodology, to measure the change in students' behaviors. Interviews were done with the teachers, community members and the families, and evaluation of the purpose of the project was measured by the commitment of the MoE to implement the same methodology. TCC hired a different consultant to conduct the evaluation for different projects last year. We believe that a regular evaluation for the programs is necessary either on an annual basis or at the end of each project.

4. Impact:

Both Programs, (the citizenship and the human rights) will contribute in increasing and improving the children and youth's access to quality education that will ensure the achievement of EFA goals. , and therefore improve the educational status that will be reflected on building a democratic society. In both programs direct and indirect beneficiaries understood the final objective of both programs, and they took actions by to achieve them. There has been influence and expansion of the activities to other communities and groups of people other than the direct beneficiaries. The targeted groups started new activities by using their experience and knowledge gained through these programs. We believe that future generations will create democratic societies despite the challenges that they face from the occupation.

At the same time the effect of both programs in developing educational staff capacities in civic education values will contribute in improving educational child rights and the building of a solid educational system based on scientific methodology. Therefore the effects of Civic Education Program will contribute in improving the educational indicators related to citizenship and social accountability, including but not limited to: development of educational polices that promote citizenship and human rights which will enhance the status of the Palestinian educational sector as one of the most influenced factors that will contribute in creating future generations of active and empowered citizens ability to build democratic society.

We believe that both programs will contribute in improving social and educational indicators related to the status of Palestinian children. Working on the same strategy, TCC will contribute in decreasing the rate of school dropout among school students, and will also contribute in the improvement of educational achievements. We believe that the continued implementation in both programs will have an effect on the average success rate among the National Tawjeehi exam therefore increasing the graduates' average to higher education institutions. The human rights program with all the activities that targeted PWD, labor children, girls and boys without gender discrimination, will contribute in meeting the gender sensitive needs in the educational system, and therefore will contribute in decreasing the side effect of gender and disability discrimination.

The effect of advocacy campaigns with the involvement of different stakeholders will contribute in enhancing the commitment to the Palestinian Disability Right Law and consequently promote the existence of an inclusive environment for persons with disability in the community in general and in the education system in specific that could contribute to an increase in the employment rate among PWD.

Enhancing the role of the civil society in achieving EFA goals at the national level, and the effect of the advocacy campaigns also will contribute in increasing the pressure on the government for more spending on education that will improve the educational process to help create a strong committed generation with the ability to challenge under the occupation. The effects of the programs developed by the Media will contribute in increasing the public awareness in citizenship and human rights values and therefore reduce corruption in Palestinian societies.

The effect of the two programs on the staff of the center will contribute in increasing the awareness at the professional level and at the social context, in which the staff will gain a clear value related to civic education and human rights terminology. They became aware of the International human rights convention, documentation of human rights violations, they gained power and self-confidence using human rights terminology to defend human rights and citizenship issues during the workshops and conferences. Therefore this will contribute in the ability of the center to expand its goals and to advocate toward policy changes toward a democratic society.

5. Sustainability

The targeted beneficiaries for both programs: the students, the educational cadre and the civil societies appear to understand the impact and the importance of the activities they implemented. They were able and motivated to continue on these activities by themselves to a high degree. At the same time, TCC was able to build a network of partners at a strategic level nationally, internationally and locally, which gave them the power to maintain the continuity of both projects, where financial support will assure the sustainability, legitimacy and increase the quality of the activities among all the targeted goals.

Many of the achieved indicators from both programs can assure sustainability of the effect of the programs especially at the school level .The capacity building for the educational cadre, the expert and the academic institutions including MoE, and UNRWA provided the participants with the knowledge and skills that they will continue to transfer to other groups or classes. We believe that they can now be considered as a human resource at the national and institutional level.

The accumulation of knowledge, skills, values and attitudes within the staff working with the TCC is considered one of the major factors that can play a role in the continuation of similar programs.

The archived materials that was produced through both programs will be one of the sustainable materials that will be used in the future such as : Quotations booklet "They

Said: Our Rights and the Leaders' Promises" , Booklet on rights of persons with disabilities, The project's brochure, "We All Have a Right to Work" brochure, Action Learning Teacher Guide, 3 documentation books for students' action learning initiatives, 3 documentation books for students' action learning initiatives and others .

At the same time the citizenship curriculum became well developed and structured which is also considered as sustainable material for future generations .TCC will keep implementing this project in new schools every year as long as the MoE remains convinced about the effect of this curriculum on the students and the educational cadre and the school itself .“ The school acquired the experience of the dropout project to benefit from it at the school level, through: the morning speech, conducting workshops talking about the issues at school level. The teachers transferred the experience to other classes. The development of awareness materials by the students, and continued encouragement of our students to make home visits for the suspected cases, we will continue conducting workshops to discuss child labor “supervisor /Hebron

The students who were trained will carry the knowledge and the skills with them to the higher education institutes, using these skills and developing them and transferring them to the surrounding environment. The projects that they designed and implemented will have a sustainable effect on the beneficiaries including the citizenship projects, the social audit and the projects for the PWD and the initiatives that targeted the students who left the school and returned.” we will be stronger and more confident entering universities since we have the experience to communicate with the teachers, and experience on how to prepare studies or graduation seminars “students focus group. The youth forums’ experience and action plans in the initiatives were documented and published in a documentary book and will be used for similar projects in the schools and will be used as awareness raising tools. At the same time the forums consisted of members from the local communities in addition to the students such as the principals , the teachers , the municipality , local societies , and sometimes Alimam mosque, which provided legitimacy for them to keep working on the same trend .Some of the local communities who participated in design and implementation of the projects promised to continue working on them even after the project , “ Some of the initiatives were given to the village councils to continue working on ” focus group teachers .

Working with MoE and UNRWA, the Teacher Creativity Center will have the chance to keep working on the citizenship project in the schools to ensure sustainability of the effect of this project on the educational cadre and students, in which MoEHE and UNRWA commit to replicating the citizenship projects, will sustain the effect of the project at the school level.

At the same time the strong relationship with MoE will allow TCC to involve and effectively participate in the strategic plan of the MoE and therefore enrich the plan with the concepts and the values of citizenship and human right., Working with advocacy campaigns at National level with wide participation from the civil societies will influence the decision makers to continue working on human rights and civic education values.

Concerning the sustainability with the right for PWD , the continuing work of TCC through the last three years with around 300 schools, enriched the students and the educational cadre with knowledge and skills in addition to change in attitudes toward PWD , where they have been considered as valuable sustained resources.

GUPWD gained the knowledge and the skills that empowered them to be one of the active unions that advocate for the right of PWD, as the leadership committed to adopt the national advocacy strategy, and use all the advocacy tools that were developed within the project. At the same time GUPWD became a member in the Palestinian Educational Coalition that will provide the chance for continuation in decision making processes. At the same time the strong ongoing relationship that TCC built with several disability sectors will ensure continuity of working with sensitization of disability issues. The Higher Council of Persons with Disabilities, Ministry of Social Affairs, Ministry of Health, Ministry of Education, Ministry of Labor, Ministry of Local Governance and UNRWA are considered important and strategic partners.

6. Challenges faced during implementation of the programs:

The TCC have been facing many challenges that had its effect on the implementation, the results and the sustainability, where several methods have been used to meet these challenges. Lack of clarity in the Political situation, the Palestinian division (two governments), the inactivation of the PLC, weakness of the political parties, and the spread of corruption phenomena at the Palestinian societies are one of the major factors that affect the work of TCC on the ground. The ability to have an effect on the policies is very difficult, Palestinian people feel frustrated and have difficulty believing in any improvement of the political situation and therefore they hardly believe in the effect of the civic education and human rights activities. TCC planned to continue on the advocacy strategy so as to mobilize the civil society toward new strategies and polices related to right for education.

One of the major challenge faced by the Palestinian institutions including TCC is the conditional or the political funding, The agenda of the policies that the funders imposed before introducing the funding does not meet the need of the Palestinian society, at the same time most of them target area C, Jerusalem and Gaza strip which lower the chances

for West Bank. In this regard TCC will keep working on convincing the donors about the need of such projects in West Bank .

Another challenge is the centralization of the MoE in which it limited the flexibility and the role of TCC within the school .There were real challenges faced by the program managers and beneficiaries, the educational cadre or the students .Time constraint is one of the challenges that the teachers, supervisors, and students faced. Some of the students had to withdraw due to overload of exams; others had to miss some classes to join the activities, interview with supervisors: “there was work overload we have to finish the projects in 5 schools in 4 months for me it’s a short time”. As there were no specialized teachers on civic education, it was difficult to convince the teachers that its part of their role to continue with the students on the same methodology used during the implementation of both programs. Another challenge was related to gender, it was difficult for female students to attend the activities or monitoring sessions after school, while there was a difficulty in involving male and female students at the same school forums. At the community level several difficulties were faced by the team, some of the mentioned were: regarding child labor the teachers faced difficulty in communication with the families regarding their child labor, while some of the employers refused to interview the students who came to visit and talk with the children at their work. Some of the municipalities were uncooperative regarding students' project and providing statistics about child labor.

The TCC continues to have the challenge of working toward institutionalization of the projects and not only implementing them at the schools. For example implementing the action learning methodology and considering students' project on citizenship as one of the graduation assets. The ability of the civic curriculum to measure the effect on the students' attitudes also posed as a challenge.

To be able to hinder some of the challenges, the staff involved the local communities from the beginning of the activities; they did regular visits for the educational cadre, the parents, and the decision makers in order to build trust.

7. Lessons learned and recommendations :

Both programs have an effect on the largest group in the Palestinian society , therefore continuation through financial and technical support for TCC will contribute in child protection ,achievement of child rights , EFA goals, and enhanced building of a democratic society despite the hardship status that the Palestinians face such as violation of human rights, racial and gender discrimination. We recommend continuation and expansion of both programs at the national level targeting the

governmental, UNRWA and private schools. The status of TCC as an active NGO, working in one of the most important sectors for development in Palestine, provides the option to attract different donors who share the same mission to support the educational process.

The educational cadre is one of the pillars of the educational sector, therefore empowering them will enhance building empowered generations ability to promote a democratic society. , The evaluation team recommends continuing with the capacity building for teachers based on their training needs, providing them with proper methodology for active learning, taking into consideration adequate time, and targeting more classes.

Since their establishment, TCC built a wide relationship with local, regional and international institutions that share common values and philosophies. TCC is recommended to benefit from this connection for fundraising, effects on the decision makers, and participate with policies at the strategic level. Strengthening the relation with the local communities and the CBOs is recommended.

TCC has a strong historical relationship with the MoE, which can affect the workflow and the performance of the staff.TCC is recommended to intensify the work on the strategic goals with the partnership of MoE, both have the capacity to play a big role in achieving EFA goals.

The advocacy campaigns is one of the effective methods that can be used to mobilize the Palestinian authority to work toward new policies regarding children and PWD .continuation along the same strategy is recommended, with involvement of more institutions, and a larger no. of groups, at the same time PEC is recommended to intensify the activities related to EFA at their institutional level.

Targeting the media for advocacy is one of the powerful resources that can spread the messages to a large number of people in an attractive way. We recommend to use a variety of means of media including films , video spots , radio spots ,etc ,We recommend to intensify the use of the social media web sites to talk about the updated events and success stories of TCC .

Regular monitoring visits is needed during the implementation of activities in the schools , to keep contact with the supervisors and the teachers who took the training to ensure that they were given the chance to implement what they trained on , and if they need any further assistant .

Take into consideration the gender factor for the meeting and timing as some of the families do not allow for their daughters to leave home after school.

Awareness session for the local people regarding child rights, PWD right, how to work on child protection and on gender equality is recommended.

TCC is expected to keep working on adoption of the policies developed with MoE , and GUPWD , related to PWD , based on UN agreements which signed by the Palestinian Authority in 2014.While most of the funders now prefer to support the projects that target human rights , democracy and gender issues .This gives the ability to TCC to expand its work .

The TCC staff needs advanced capacity building so as to share common philosophy and value related concepts to civic education and human rights.

For the TCC to be able to sustain its effect on the ground , formalization of local bodies /committees at the community level is recommended , involving members from the students and local people , these communities will advocate for human rights and citizenship issues , supported by TCC , while this work will require financial and technical support .

To be able to justify the importance of implementing such a programs through targeting the youth for developing a democratic society ,scientific researches and studies are needed to be done at the national level and at the target group level. For example base line / end line studies, regular evaluations for the programs and projects are recommended to conclude the lessons learned and recommendations for further improvement.

For lessons learned, and to be able to transfer the experience at the national and regional level, documentation of the civic education model is recommended.

Future perspective of TCC:

The TCC is working toward formation of a committee from the students and the educational cadre to be involved in the creation and modification of the center policies (Hidden committee). In which we think that this committee can play a big role in building a bridge of cooperation between TCC and the local communities .

The TCC future plan is to expand the program at the university level, with the cooperation of MoEHE, Also, include capacity training for the university students to involve them in the schools to participate in the structuring of the curriculum and follow up, and also work on a developmental plan for the schools. The evaluation team believes that expanding the two programs to target the university students will contribute in improving the outcome of the projects , at the same time the university students can be involved in the school activities

Annexes:

1. Focus groups teachers / supervisors :

Date	Description	Location	No. of participants	Male	Female
13/8/2015	Teachers	Ramallah , Jerusalem	4	3	1

Date		Position	School	Sex	Phone no.
20/8/2015	Riham harb	Teacher	Althahrieh secondary girl	F	0569883415
	Najah Ali Naser	Teacher	Alburj girls	F	0599727552
	Iyad Mohamed Almasri	Principle	Yattah boys	M	0599423873
	Hilmi Mosa Khilawi	Teacher	Beat Awa boys	M	0599873500
	Ayed Alhalaq	Supervisor	Raqa'a boys	M	0599232831
	Hashem Radi	Supervisor	Jenin Alasa'asa mixed	M	0599814200
	Nor Aldeen Hamdan	Supervisor	jenin Beat Albash boys	M	0599670663

2. Interview :

Date	Name	Description	Location	Sex
11/8/2015	Fadi Khaleel	Supervisor	Jerusalem	M
11/8/2015	Amen Abu Khaleel	Supervisor	Jerusalem	M
17/8/2015	Mohamed Sharawneh	Supervisor	Yatta	M
19/8/1015	Mohamed abed alraoof	Supervisor	Qabatia /Tubas	M
19/8/1015	Rami abed alafo	Principle	Izatabualrub school	M
20/8/2015	Afaf Mazara'a	PEC	PMRS	F
20/8/2015	Nizar Basalat	acting manager for youth and sport council	GUPWD	M
24/8/2015	Tharwat Zeed	المدير العام supervision and rehabilitation general director and responsible of projects department	MoE	M
24/8/2015	Rifa'at Sabah	TCC general director	TCC	M
24/8/2015	Osama Zamel	Financial	TCC	M

		department		
3/9/2015	Hala Qubaj	Civic education program manager	TCC	F
	Intesar Hamdan	Human right program manager	TCC	F

3. Focus groups students :

Date	Name	School	sex
17/8/2015	Abdallah Ibraheem	Yatta	M
	Abd Alnaser Dawood	Yatta	M
	Saed Issa Hammamdeh	Yatta	M
	Amen Jihad	Yatta	M
19/8/2015	Suhib Kameel	Izatabualrub school	M
	Raghib Nazal	Izatabualrub school	M
	احمد ابو الرب	Izatabualrub school	M
	مصعب زكارنة	Izatabualrub school	M
	محمد مناصرة	Izatabualrub school	M
	احمد جمال	Boys secondary school Tubas	M
	سليمان علي دراغمة	Boys secondary school Tubas	M